THE YSTERFONTEIN 1 MIDDLE STONE AGE ROCK SHELTER AND THE EVOLUTION OF COASTAL FORAGING

\rm{GRAHAM} AVERY 1 , DAVID HALKETT 2 , JAYSON ORTON 2 , TERESA STEELE $^{3^*}$, MADELON TUSENIUS² & RICHARD KLEIN⁴

1 Cenozoic Studies, Natural History Division, Iziko South African Museum, P.O. Box 61, Cape Town, 8000, South Africa Department of Archaeology, University of Cape Town, Rondebosch, 7701, South Africa

E-mail: gavery@iziko.org.za

*2 Archaeology Contracts Office, University of Cape Town, Rondebosch, 7701, South Africa E-mails: david.halkett@uct.ac.za; jayson.orton@uct.ac.za 3 Department of Anthropology, University of California, Davis, CA 95616, USA *corresponding author. E-mail: testeele@ucdavis.edu 4 Program in Human Biology, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305, USA*

E-mail: rklein@stanford.edu

ABSTRACT

The Ysterfontein 1 rock shelter (33°20'S, 18°09'E) is located in the eponymous town, on the west coast of South Africa, roughly 70 km north-northwest of Cape Town. The floor is diorite at 7 m above mean sea level and the roof is calcrete. Road construction removed the entrance and exposed 3.8 m of stratified sands that completely filled the rear. The uppermost layers, to a depth of 1–1.5 m, contain few artefacts or faunal remains per unit volume, and they dip into the shelter. Tooth-marked bones and occasional coprolites indicate that small carnivores and hyaenas sometimes lived inside the shelter. However, the low ceiling and the sediment dip suggest that the encroaching sands originated on the back face of a dune that stood near the shelter mouth. Middle Stone Age (MSA) activity on the dune crest probably accounts for the occasional artefacts and intertidal shells. Below 1.5 m depth, the layers lie more horizontally, and stacked hearth lenses, numerous artefacts, and abundant intertidal shells document MSA occupation. An accelerator mass spectrometry (AMS) radiocarbon reading on ostrich eggshell places the occupation before 46 ka (thousand years) ago. It probably postdates 115 ka ago, since storm surges during a period of high sea-level that ended about then would probably have flushed any pre-existing deposit. The artefact assemblage lacks markers of the Howieson's Poort and Still Bay variants of the MSA, and it may predate either or both of them. Optically Stimulated Luminescence analysis of sand grains from various stratified units may provide a more precise age estimate. The MSA fauna resembles faunas from other west coast MSA sites in the rarity or absence of fish, the heavy emphasis on a limited range of shellfish, and the large size of limpets and tortoises. Like faunal collections from MSA sites on the south coast of South Africa, the Ysterfontein 1 fauna suggests that people in the MSA exploited coastal resources less intensively than their Later Stone Age (LSA) successors and that their populations were smaller. Thus, even if MSA artefacts from Blombos Cave and other sites sometimes imply LSA-like culture, they do not appear to have conferred an LSA-like ability to survive and reproduce. This may explain why people in the MSA failed to expand from Africa.

Keywords: Middle Stone Age ecology, stone age coastal foraging, 'Out of Africa' hypothesis.

INTRODUCTION

South Africa is unique for the discovery of deeply stratified shell middens that predate 50 ka (thousand years) ago. Sites of similar antiquity in Morocco,Algeria, Libya, Lebanon, Italy, France, and Gibraltar (Table 1) have produced small numbers of intertidal shells, sometimes with bones of coastal vertebrates, but only the ancient South African sites (Table 2; Fig. 1) have provided true shell middens. They closely resemble much younger middens that date from the Holocene epoch, after 12–11 ka ago, and that have been found on every inhabited continent (Erlandson 2001; Erlandson & Moss 2001). In Africa, most of the Holocene shell middens are associated with Later Stone Age (LSA) technology, but in South Africa the much older shell middens have Middle Stone Age (MSA) associations. The dating of the LSA/MSA transition is not resolved, because the early LSA is almost unknown in southern Africa and poorly known elsewhere. However, age estimates from Enkapune Ya Muto, Kenya, suggest the LSA was in place 50–45 ka ago (Ambrose 1998). This means that the anatomically modern Africans who expanded to Eurasia at about this time were probably people with early LSA technologies. In Eurasia, they swamped or replaced the Neanderthals and other nonmodern humans, and they created the Upper Palaeolithic.

Earlier LSA and Upper Palaeolithic shell middens, with ages between 50–45 and 12 ka old, are unknown, but the early occupants of the Bismarck and Solomon Islands, northwestern Melanesia, have produced unambiguous middens between roughly 35 and 12 ka old (Allen *et al.* 1988; Wickler & Spriggs 1988; Allen 1994; Gillespie 2002; Leavesley *et al.* 2002). The shorelines of the Melanesian islands fall off steeply, and the middens occur in caves whose distance to the coast barely changed even when global sea-levels rose sharply after 14–12 ka ago. In contrast, most contemporaneous African and European middens would have formed on the seaward margins of more gentle continental shelves and they would now be submerged. In their absence, however, the occurrence of MSA and LSA middens in South Africa still provides an opportunity to investigate aspects of coastal foraging before and after the modern human expansion. Cultural changes in Africa are often assumed to underlie the expansion, and a comparison of MSA and LSA middens could help to establish whether or not there was a difference in human ability to exploit natural resources. In this paper we address the possibility of such a difference by comparing the MSA midden in the Ysterfontein 1 rock shelter and local LSA middens. We conclude that the MSA inhabitants of Ysterfontein 1 exploited coastal resources less intensively. The reason was probably that MSA populations were smaller and more sparsely distributed, perhaps because MSA technology could not support as many people.

Ysterfontein 1 (YFT1) (33°20'S, 18°09'E) is located on the west coast of South Africa, 70 km north-northwest of Cape Town. There are four other known MSA middens on the west coast: Boegoeberg 2, Hoedjiespunt 1 and 3, and Sea Harvest (references in Table 2; locations in Fig. 1), and mining disturbance indicates that more middens lie deeply buried below coastal sands (Parkington 2003; Parkington 2006). However,

TABLE 1. *North African and European coastal or near-coastal Middle Palaeolithic sites with intertidal shells. The listing proceeds roughly counterclockwise around the Mediterranean Sea. The Abdur Reef site on the Red Sea coast of Eritrea has provided artefacts, shells, and large mammal bones with firm age estimates of about 125 ka ago (Walter* et al. *2000; Bruggemann* et al. *2003), and it may one day extend the list. However, most of the artefacts do not appear to lie where they were dropped, and none are directly stratified with shells or bones.*

| Site | References | | | |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | |
| Smugglers' Cave (Grotte des Contrebandiers) (Témara), Morocco | Roche & Texier 1976; Bouzouggar et al. 2002 | | | |
| Zouhrah Cave (El Harhoura 1), Morocco | Debénath & Sbihi-Alaoui 1979; Aouraghe 2004 | | | |
| Mugharet el 'Aliya (Tangiers), Morocco | Howe & Movius 1947; Howe 1967; Bouzouggar et al. 2002 | | | |
| Bérard open-air site, Algeria | Roubet 1969 | | | |
| Haua Fteah, Libya | McBurney 1967; Klein & Scott 1986 | | | |
| Ras el-Kelb Cave, Lebanon | Copeland & Moloney 1998; Reece 1998 | | | |
| Moscerini Cave and possibly other coastal caves, Italy | Stiner 1994; Stiner 1999; Stiner 2001 | | | |
| Ramandils Cave, France | Cleyet-Merle & Madelaine 1995 | | | |
| Devil's Tower Rock Shelter, Gibraltar | Garrod et al. 1928; Lalueza-Fox & Pérez-Pérez 1993 | | | |
| Gorham's Cave, Gibraltar | Waechter 1964; Eastham 1989; Barton et al. 1999; Barton 2000; Pettitt & Bailey 2000; Rink et al. 2000 | | | |
| Vanguard Cave, Gibraltar | Barton et al. 1999; Barton 2000; Fernández-Jalvo & Andrews 2000; Pettitt & Bailey 2000 | | | |
| | | | | |

Ysterfontein 1 has produced by far the largest artefact and faunal samples, and it is likely that further excavation will provide even larger samples.

The south coast of South Africa has produced five MSA midden sites: Die Kelders cave 1, Blombos Cave, Herolds Bay, the Pinnacle Point caves and the Klasies River Main Cave complex (Table 2; Fig. 1). We do not consider Herolds Bay and the Pinnacle Point caves in this paper, because their MSA samples are small. We have also excluded Die Kelders 1, because acidic ground waters have reduced its once-abundant MSA shells to tiny fragments, and only bones of seals and marine birds survive to document coastal exploitation. The two remaining south coast sites, Blombos and the Klasies River complex, are central to our conclusions, since in key respects, they contrast with local LSA middens in the same way that MSA and LSA middens contrast on the west coast. West and south coast environments differ significantly, and terrestrial and especially shellfish species in the MSA sites show that the difference is long-standing. This increases the likelihood that differences in culture, as opposed to differences in palaeoenvironment, explain why MSA coastal exploitation differs from LSA exploitation in broadly the same way on both coasts.

YFT1 EXCAVATION HISTORY AND METHODOLOGY

In the early 1980s, contractors enlarging the parking lot for the small boat harbour in the town of Ysterfontein (also known as Yzerfontein) cut back the slope along the access road and exposed 3–4 m of sands resting on a diorite platform 5 m above the road and 7 m above mean sea-level. Shortly afterwards, Avery observed the infrequent presence of marine shells, bones, ostrich eggshell fragments and MSA artefacts in the sands. In February 1998 and April 1999, John Parkington and University of Cape Town students collected artefacts and shells that had eroded from the exposure. Inspection of the section indicated that continuing erosion threatened the deposit, and that safe excavation required the placement of scaffolding against the diorite platform.

In May 2002, Halkett, Hart and Yates erected a 6-m-high scaffold and laid out a 50 cm \times 50 cm grid over the site (Fig. 2). They excavated in three discrete sectors and established that the deposits were richest and most conspicuously stratified in the easternmost one (squares D–L 32–35 in Fig. 2) (Halkett*et al.*

2003). A follow-up season in 2003 confirmed this result (Klein *et al.* 2004), and there have been excavations in each subsequent year, making a total of 6 seasons over about 32 weeks. This paper covers the first five seasons (including 2006). Sorting of the material excavated in 2007 is proceeding and we plan a 6-week excavation in 2008.

The excavations show that the deposits fill a rock shelter that formed at the contact between the diorite below and calcrete above (Figs $3 \& 4$). The contractors destroyed the front part of the shelter and discarded an indeterminable quantity of cultural debris. The floor and roof of the shelter are well-defined, but scree obscures its lateral extent. We plan to expand the present excavation westwards and to excavate the sequence to bedrock over as large an area as possible.

We excavate with wooden skewers and domestic vacuum cleaners to limit damage to bones and shells, and we mend fragmented bones and shells, in place, with Paraloid B72 (reversible acetone-based glue) to facilitate subsequent removal, identification, and measurement. We record all objects to 50 cm \times 50 cm grid square and to natural stratigraphic units defined by sediment texture and colour, and by minor nonconformities, including carbonized lenses that mark ancient fireplaces. We sieve the excavated sediment from each square and stratigraphic unit with stacked 3 mm and 1.5 mm mesh screens. In the field we sort the material from the 3 mm screen into categories consisting of artefacts, bones, major types of intertidal shells, and ostrich eggshell, and we retain the remaining material from each screen for possible further investigation in the laboratory. We undertake final sorting and analysis in the Archaeology and Cenozoic Studies laboratories of the Iziko South African Museum in Cape Town.

SITE FORMATION

The YFT1 fill comprises 3.8 m of bedded, highly calcareous sands that incorporate pebble-to-boulder size blocks of aeolianite, calcrete, and especially, diorite (Fig. 4). We have employed relatively small differences in sand texture and colour to define stratigraphic units in the field and grosser differences to lump these into thirteen stratigraphically successive groups that are broadly analogous to 'members' as defined at Boomplaas Cave (Deacon 1979, 1995) and Klasies River Main (Deacon & Geleijnse 1988; Deacon 1995). These thirteen **TABLE 2**. *South African sites that document MSA and LSA coastal foraging. The listings proceed from southeast to northwest along the South African coastline. Figure 1 shows their approximate locations.*

groups, in turn, have been divided into two groups, based on their probable mode of accumulation:

Groups 1–3 (0.8–1 m thick). Individual units in these groups tend to dip into the shelter, and they contain few cultural or faunal items per unit volume. This is particularly true of Groups 1 and 2, which have very few artefacts. Group 1 abuts the calcrete roof. Groups 2 and 3 formed when the shelter floor was a metre or less from the roof. Tooth-marked bones in Groups 1 and 2 imply that mongooses, jackals, or other small carnivores sheltered in the site, and bones of tiny fish (<10 cm) and small mammals probably originated from the small carnivores' decomposed scats. A coprolite in Group 3 shows that hyaenas sometimes visited, although a patch of burned sediment in Group 3 argues that people occasionally entered as well. However, the low roof and inward dip of the layers suggest that the sands of Groups 1–3 and many of the enclosed objects slid down the back face of a long-vanished dune that stood in front of the cave. MSA activity on the dune crest

FIG. 1. *The approximate locations of MSA and LSA sites mentioned in the text. Boldface marks the MSA sites, some of which (Klipfonteinrand, Klein Kliphuis, Diepkloof Shelter, Die Kelders 1, Blombos, Nelson Bay and Klasies River) also have LSA occupations.*

probably accounts for the occasional artefacts and the more numerous intertidal shells.

Groups 4 and below (2.5–2.8 m thick). Individual units in these groups tend to be more horizontal than those in Groups 1–3. Compared to units in the higher-lying groups, the units from Groups 4 and below are significantly richer in artefacts, shells and bones per unit volume. Calcrete debris that probably signals roof collapse separates Groups 6 and 7 ('Lower Calcrete' in Figs 4 & 5). A lens of carbonized/carbonaceous sediment that is the uppermost unambiguous hearth occurs near the top of Group 4. Additional carbonaceous lenses, 50–100 cm across, are common in the lower-lying groups, where they appear stacked, as at Klasies River Main (Deacon 1995). Wind transport, perhaps supplemented by sandy feet, probably introduced the sands in Groups 4 and below, and people probably contributed the shells and most of the bones. Two coprolites in Group 4, together with aspects of the fauna that we consider below, imply that hyaenas could also have contributed some of the bones in Groups 4 and 5. Hearth lenses, abundant artefacts, and densely packed shell (Fig. 5) indicate that people accumulated most material in Groups 6 and below.

Disturbances, produced by dune molerats, other burrowing mammals or possibly by roots, intruded the YFT1 strata at all levels. The intrusions contain similar artefacts, shells, and bones as adjacent undisturbed stratigraphic units. When we were unable to determine the stratigraphic origin of an intrusion, we excluded its contents from the analysis.

DATING

The diorite platform that is the floor of YFT1 stands at \sim 7 m above mean sea-level, which coincides closely with the maximum height of the Last Interglacial sea, near the close of Oxygen Isotope Stage (OIS) 5e. The maximum has been most recently fixed between 122 and 119 ka ago (Hearty *et al.* 2007), and if the shelter existed then, storm surges would probably have flushed its contents. Further excavation in the lowermost levels, just above bedrock, may confirm this. An accelerator mass spectrometry (AMS) radiocarbon reading (Beta 171203) on ostrich eggshell places the top of the sequence before 46 ka ago. The sediments therefore probably accumulated sometime between 119 and 46 ka ago. However, sand samples extracted from Groups 1, 6, 12, and 13 have provided single-grain Optically Stimulated Luminescence (OSL) ages of 128.6 \pm 6.3 ka, 120.6 ± 6.6 ka, 132.1 ± 8.0 ka and 127.5 ± 8.8 ka, respectively (Zenobia Jacobs, pers. comm. 2007). The OSL ages may be correct, but the method relies on largely unverifiable, site-specific assumptions concerning the geochemical history of the deposit. We therefore conclude that its age has yet to be resolved.

The position of the past shoreline may aid age resolution, since intertidal shells abound throughout the YFT1 sequence, and archaeologists have long assumed that foragers would not routinely carry quantities of shell or other food items more than 10 km (Higgs *et al.* 1967; Higgs & Vita-Finzi 1972; Bigalke 1973; Erlandson 2001). The offshore topography at YFT1 indicates that a drop in sea-level of about 50 m would be required to displace the shore at least 10 km in all directions from the present site location (Fig. 6). Therefore, the history of global sea-level changes after 150 ka ago suggests that people probably did not occupy YFT1 during OIS 5d, between roughly 119 ka and 110 ka ago, or during most of OIS 4, between about 71 ka and 59 ka ago (Fig. 6). Assuming that MSA occupation must postdate the OIS 5e high stand at 122–119 ka, sea-level history places it sometime within OIS 5c to 5a, between about 110 and 71 ka ago, or in the latter part of OIS 3, between roughly 59 and 50 ka ago. The sporadic occurrence of a warm water (south coast) mussel species, discussed below, favours an OIS 5c–5a age. The artefacts, also discussed below, further support such an estimate, since they probably predate the Howieson's Poort variant of the MSA, whose appearance coincides closely with the OIS 5a/4 transition at roughly 70 ka ago (Deacon 1995; Vogel 2001; Tribolo *et al*. 2005a,b; Valladas *et al.* 2005; Rigaud *et al.* 2006).

FIG. 2. *Topographic map of YFT1 (original by Royden Yates). Dark grey indicates the excavated sectors and light grey indicates the areas cleaned for initial testing. The remains described in this paper are mainly from squares D–L 32–35.*

ARTEFACTS

YFT1 has provided no worked bones or bone artefacts, and in this respect, it is similar to most other MSA sites (d'Errico & Henshilwood 2007). So far, only the MSA layers of Blombos Cave have produced shaped bones whose stratigraphic origin, number, and repetitive form unequivocally imply a bone artefact industry or tradition (Henshilwood *et al.* 2001a; see also Backwell*et al.* 2008). Sarah Wurz (Iziko South African Museum) is analysing the YFT1 stone artefacts and will describe them separately. At present the assemblage comprises more than 7000 flakes or flaked pieces and it includes radial cores and flakes, and blades with faceted butts that place it within the MSA. Silcrete is the most common raw material overall, followed by calcrete, quartz, and diorite, but the materials vary in frequency among stratigraphic groups. The assemblage includes relatively few formal (retouched) tools, but continuous, scraper-like retouch occurs on a few pieces, and denticulate retouch is relatively common. Both flakes and blades are denticulated, often on both edges, and the blades or flake-blades are sometimes broken or snapped. On some tools the lateral edges converge to a point and the artefacts appear remarkably refined (Fig. 7).

YFT1 has yielded neither backed elements, especially segments and trapezes that define the Howieson's Poort variant of the MSA, nor bifacial points that define the Still Bay variant. The assemblage is large enough to exclude sample size as a likely explanation. Moreover, the Sea Harvest site, Saldanha Bay (Volman 1978), has produced a remarkably similar assemblage in similar geomorphic context. This raises the question of the chronological relationship between YFT1 and Sea Harvest on the one hand, and the Howieson's Poort and Still Bay variants on the other. Recent excavations at

FIG. 3. *Top: YFT1 rock shelter seen from a hill above the parking lot at the Ysterfontein small boat harbour. Bottom: the rock shelter from across the road below. Excavation is mainly in the area to the left of the scaffolding tower.*

Diepkloof (Parkington *et al.* 2005; Rigaud *et al.* 2006) and Sibudu Cave (Wadley 2007) show that the Still Bay precedes the Howieson's Poort. This result was anticipated by unfinished or partial bifacial points below the Howieson's Poort occupations at Nelson Bay Cave (Volman 1981) and Klasies River Main (Singer & Wymer 1982). Luminescence age estimations and geologic inference at various sites place the Howieson's Poort between about 70 and 55 ka old (Deacon 1995; Vogel 2001; Tribolo *et al.* 2005a,b; Valladas *et al.* 2005; Rigaud *et al.* 2006), and luminescence readings on sands and burned artefacts at Blombos Cave show that the Still Bay was underway 80–75 ka ago (Jacobs *et al.* 2003b).

A denticulate-poor assemblage overlies the Howieson's Poort at Klein Kliphuis (Mackay 2006), whereas an assemblage with well-made denticulates underlies it at Klipfonteinrand (Alex Mackay, pers. comm. 2007) (Fig. 1). This suggests YFT1 and Sea Harvest are older than the Howieson's Poort. An assemblage with denticulates underlies the Still Bay at Hollow Rock Shelter (Evans 1994), and could imply that YFT1 and Sea Harvest also predate the Still Bay. Alternatively, YFT1 and Sea Harvest may fall between the Still Bay and the Howieson's Poort. On-going analysis of artefacts from the deeply stratified deposits at Diepkloof may eventually suggest the answer.

Like most MSA sites, YFT1 has produced pigment chunks that the inhabitants collected and then ground or rubbed to produce powder (Fig. 8). Pigment smears from grinding or rubbing also occur on at least two diorite chunks and one

diorite cobble. Red pigment chunks dominate at YFT1 and other southern African MSA sites. Besides YFT1, black pigment has been reported only from Hollow Rock Shelter and Border Cave (Watts 2002). YFT1 supports previous evidence that during the MSA interest in pigment transcended changes in preferred artefact types, and people may have employed it variously, perhaps in art or ritual (Watts 2002), or more prosaically in hide-tanning and especially, in the production of resinous adhesives (Wadley *et al.* 2004; Lombard 2005; Wadley 2005a; Lombard 2007; Lombard & Wadley 2007). The adhesive would have functioned mainly to fasten stone tools, possibly including some of the YFT1 denticulates, to wooden handles or hafts.

YFT1 has produced no perforated shells like the Blombos Cave specimens that have been interpreted as MSA beads (d'Errico *et al.* 2005). YFT1 lacks tick shells (*Nassarius kraussianus*) on which the perforations occur at Blombos. Tick shells are estuarine scavengers, and their absence at YFT1 may reflect the persistent absence of estuaries nearby.

VERTEBRATES

OVERVIEW

The YFT1 vertebrate fossils are almost entirely from snakes, tortoises, mammals and birds. A few tiny fish bones occur in disturbed sediments at the top of the sequence, where they could have been introduced in scats of small carnivores, or perhaps as regurgitations from roosting cormorants. Bones from fish that may have been consumed by humans are totally absent. Other coastal MSA sites also tend to lack fish, and where fish bones occur, mainly at Klasies River (Singer & Wymer 1982) and Blombos Cave (Henshilwood *et al.* 2001b), they are rare compared to mammal and bird bones. The opposite is generally true at coastal LSA sites, where fish bones often outnumber mammal and bird bones by an order of magnitude. Only LSA sites have provided artefacts that anticipate ethnohistorically observed fishing gear (Deacon 1984b; Inskeep 1987). These artefacts and the frequency of fish bones suggest that people fished routinely only in the LSA. This is very significant, because fish are abundant in coastal waters, and fishing alone could account for the larger LSA human populations we infer, below, from tortoise and limpet size.

Snakes are represented by 552 vertebrae that we could not identify to genus and species. We do not consider them further here. Tortoises are represented by pieces of carapace and plastron from the angulate (or bowsprit) species (*Chersina angulata*). Speckled tortoises (*Homopus signatus*) have occasionally been observed on the west coast, but only the angulate tortoise is common, and its carapace and plastron heavily dominate all west coast archaeological samples. It thus seems reasonable to assume that angulate tortoises provided the vast majority of tortoise limb bones at YFT1 and other sites. This assumption is important, because the pieces of carapace and plastron tend to be too fragmented to provide individual counts or useful measurements, and for these, we have relied on limb bones, particularly the relatively common distal humeri and distal femora. We rely on distal humeri in the next section, where we emphasize the large average size of YFT1 and other MSA specimens.

The YFT1 mammals and birds represent a variety of species, but the samples are relatively small, and we have divided them into three gross stratigraphic units: Upper, including stratigraphic Groups 1–3; Middle, including Groups 4 and 5; and Lower, including Groups 6–13. The three subdivisions broadly reflect the apparent decline in human activity inside the shelter as the fill approached the roof. Tables

FIG. 4. *Profile of YFT1 stratigraphic groups 1 to 13 along the B–L 35/36 line, exposed at the end of the 2007 season. Finer units within each group are not indicated in the section. The locations of OSL samples are approximate. They are correct on the vertical and the north–south axes, but the east–west location is projected onto the 35/36 line. The larger rocks only are indicated, although many associated smaller ones were also found.*

3 and 4 list the identified mammal and bird species, the number of identified specimens (NISP) in each major subdivision, and the minimum number of individuals (MNI) that are represented. Ostrich is represented by both bones and eggshell, and the eggshell 'NISPs' in Table 4 are weights. The 'MNIs' are the minimum numbers of eggs required to produce the weights, assuming that an average complete shell weighs about 238 g (Kandel 2004; and similar to the value of 222 g provided by Keffen & Jarvis (1984)).

THE AGENCIES OF BONE ACCUMULATION

Raptors are an unlikely source of bones at YFT1, since the shelter probably lacked suitable roosts. In addition, none of the bones exhibits the kind of acid-etching or 'reduction' that is found on the MSA dune molerats accumulated by large raptors at Die Kelders Cave 1 (Klein & Cruz-Uribe 2000). Porcupines are more likely bone collectors at YFT1, and their bones occur in the deposit. However, YFT1 lacks bones with the tell-tale gnaw marks that characterize porcupine accumulations (Brain 1981; Kerbis Peterhans & Singer 2006). Bones that were probably chewed by jackals, mongooses, or other small carnivores occur in the Upper subdivision, and small carnivore digging might also account for some of the stratigraphic disturbances that are particularly conspicuous there. As discussed below, small carnivores may have introduced some of the abundant dune molerat bones.

Hyaenas could have contributed some of the larger mam-

mal bones, and occasional coprolites place hyaenas in the shelter when the youngest deposits accumulated. The Swartklip fossil hyaena den on False Bay (Hendey & Hendey 1968; Klein 1975) underscores a potential hyaena role, since it includes all the YFT1 terrestrial carnivore and ungulate species. It lacks fur seals, because it dates from a time when sea-level was much lower and False Bay was drained, but near-coastal hyaena dens in Namibia and a fossil hyaena den at Boegoeberg 1, Northern Cape Province, demonstrate that brown hyaenas (*Hyaena brunnea*) can concentrate fur seal bones (Skinner & van Aarde 1991; Klein *et al.* 1999).

A hyaena contribution to YFT1 could explain why five of the seven blue antelopes in the Upper and Middle subdivisions were neonates, with erupting, unworn deciduous teeth. Like the newborn of their closest living relatives (Skinner $\&$ Chimimba 2005), newborn blue antelopes probably 'lay out' in dense vegetation while their mothers grazed nearby, and in this state, they would have been more vulnerable to hyaenas than to people. Hyaena activity could further explain why ostrich eggshell is especially abundant in the Upper and Middle subdivisions, both absolutely and relative to other items, particularly intertidal shells (Fig. 9). The Swartklip den and observations on free-ranging brown hyaenas (Mills 1978; Skinner & van Aarde 1991) demonstrate hyaena interest in ostrich eggs. Hyaena teeth produce characteristic damage to eggshells (Kandel 2004), and both Swartklip and YFT1 have provided fragments that match the pattern. Other west coast

FIG. 5. *Top: profile of YFT1 stratigraphic groups 7 to 12 along the J/K 34–35 line. Note the alternating carbonized sediments and the density of limpets and black mussels that protrude from the section. The tags mark finer units within each group. Bottom: exposure of limpets, mussels, and bone from K–L 33–34, towards the base of statigraphic group 4.*

MSA sites at Boegoeberg 2, Sea Harvest, and Hoedjiespunt (references in Table 2) are also rich in ostrich eggshell, compared not only to regional LSA sites but also to south coast MSA sites, and in a previous report on YFT1, we suggested that during the MSA people along the west coast may have been unusually interested in ostrich eggs (Klein *et al.* 2004). Larger samples have now demonstrated stratigraphic variation in eggshell abundance at YFT1. We believe that hyaenas may account for much of the eggshell at YFT1 and the other west coast sites, particularly at Sea Harvest and Hoedjiespunt, where it was not possible to achieve the YFT1 level of stratigraphic resolution.

Hyaenas are unlikely to have brought many dune molerat bones to YFT1, since bones of such small mammals are uncommon at Swartklip and other fossil dens, probably because the hyaenas completely consumed any small carcasses they obtained. Dune molerats do not accumulate bones themselves, but they dig extensive tunnels, reaching up to 400 m in length when side branches are included, and they feed on roots, bulbs, forbs, and grasses which they pull down into their tunnels (Davies & Jarvis 1986; Herbst & Bennett 2006). Conceivably, dune molerat tunneling produced many of the stratigraphic disturbances to which we have previously referred, and this raises the possibility that dune molerats died naturally in the site.

On the other hand, dune molerats would have no incentive to tunnel into a rock shelter, partly because the sediments would have been relatively coarse and non-homogeneous and partly because the surface would not have supported suitable food plants. In addition, dune molerats are solitary and territorial. Average population density is less than one per hectare, and individuals do not tunnel into the territories of their neighbours. Molerat bones are remarkably rare in open-air archaeological sites, including Dunefield Midden, Kasteelberg B, and Bakoond (references in Table 2), even where numerous mounds signal molerat activity nearby. Archaeologically, molerat bones abound only in caves or rock shelters, such as Blombos Cave, Die Kelders Cave 1, Byneskranskop Cave 1,

FIG. 6. *Left: offshore bathymetry in the vicinity of Ysterfontein (modified after South African Navy 1981). Depths are in metres below sea level. Right upper: Global sea level history during the last 150 ka (modified after Miller* et al. *2005: fig. S2; Hearty* et al. *2007: fig. 10). The figure indicates that a drop in sea level of about 50 m would be required to displace the shore at least 10 km from YFT1.*

Elands Bay Cave, and Tortoise Cave (references in Table 2), where people or other predators almost certainly accumulated them. We cannot rule out the possibility that many of the YFT1 dune molerat bones were a result of natural deaths in the shelter, especially in the Upper layers, but it seems more likely that people or small carnivores brought in the majority.

In summary, people and carnivores probably accumulated most of the YFT1 bones, and carnivores were perhaps particularly important in the Upper subdivision when people were rarely, if ever, in the shelter. People were probably much more important accumulators in the Middle and Lower subdivisions, where numerous artefacts, stacked fireplaces, and dense accumulations of shell document human presence. Macroscopically obvious stone tool marks on bone confirm a human role (Fig. 10), and many additional marks might become apparent under magnification. We plan a microscopic study of bone surfaces after the 2008 season, when the bone sample will be much larger. We predict that stone tool damage will confirm the suggested importance of people as bone accumulators in the Lower and Middle subdivisions.

PALAEOENVIRONMENTAL IMPLICATIONS

The Cape dune molerat is common in sandy areas near YFT1 today, and its abundance in the deposit suggests long-term persistence of the sandy soils and plant species on which dune molerats depend. Historically, the distribution of the dune molerat coincided roughly with the distribution of the

angulate tortoise, and their co-occurrence at YFT1 is mirrored at Diepkloof, Elands Bay Cave, Die Kelders Cave 1, Blombos Cave and many other archaeological sites along the west and southwest coasts of South Africa (references in Table 2). However, both dune molerats and tortoises are rare at sites like Klasies River, Nelson Bay, and Noetzie within the forested strip that stretches along the south-central coast from roughly George to Humansdorp (approximately 23°30'S to 24°40'E), and they do not appear to have become more common there even when fossil ungulates indicate that forest cover had given way to grassland. The key variable past and present may have been rainfall, which historically fell mainly in winter on the west and southwest coasts and more evenly throughout the year on the south-central coast. In this light, the abundance of dune molerats and tortoises at YFT1 suggests that rainfall remained largely confined to winter when the deposits formed, even if other indicators we summarize below indicate that rainfall was greater or more effective.

The fur seal and marine birds occur nearby today, and like the associated shells, they signal the proximity of the shore when the deposits accumulated. In contrast, the zebra, blue antelope, southern reedbuck, black wildebeest, greater kudu, and long-horned buffalo were unknown in the region historically and have not been found in any regional site that postdates 10 ka ago. The long-horned buffalo became extinct about 10 ka ago, but its habits can be broadly inferred from its anatomy and the habits of its surviving relatives, particularly

FIG. 7. *A silcrete convergent denticulate from the MSA layers at YFT1 (photograph: T.E. Steele).*

the Cape buffalo (*Syncerus caffer*). Historically, the vegetation in the YFT1 region was dominated by sclerophyllous (fynbos) shrubs that supplied too little food to sustain the extralimital ungulates, and their occurrence implies vegetation in which both grasses (vital for all but the kudu) and broad-leaved browse (crucial for the kudu) were significantly more common. In addition, the reedbuck, and probably also the spur-winged goose and coot, imply standing fresh water where none exists today.

Average dune molerat size can be used to check and supplement the palaeoenvironmental implications of the ungulates and birds. Dune molerat size and rainfall are positively correlated at present (Klein 1991), probably because greater rainfall increases the density of plants on which dune molerats feed. The distal humerus is the best proxy for estimating past dune molerat size, because it is particularly robust and it tends to be especially common in fossil samples. Measurements of distal humeri show that the MSA molerats at Blombos Cave (Henshilwood *et al.* 2001b) and Die Kelders Cave 1 (Klein & Cruz-Uribe 2000) tended to be significantly larger than their LSA counterparts, and the Die Kelders humeri include the largest on record. The LSA humeri at both sites postdate 2 ka

FIG. 8. *Top: ground lump of black (manganiferous) pigment (photograph: T.P. Volman). Bottom: red (ferruginous) pigment from YFT1 (photograph: T.E. Steele). Red pigment lumps dominate at YFT1 and other southern African MSA sites. So far, besides YFT1, black pigment has been reported only from Hollow Rock Shelter and Border Cave (Watts 2002).*

ago, and they closely approximate local historic specimens in average size. The MSA humeri thus present especially strong evidence that the MSA occupations occurred under moisterthan-historic conditions. Molerat humeri from adjacent YFT1 stratigraphic groups have been combined to provide numerically meaningful samples, and there are no humeri from stratigraphic groups 10–13. Figure 11 shows, however, that the humeri in groups 1–5 and 6–9 averaged larger than historical rainfall would predict, and they complement the ungulate species to imply a relatively humid palaeoenvironment. The caption to Figure 11 provides supporting detail.

IMPLICATIONS FOR HUMAN BEHAVIOUR

Contrasts between MSA and LSA mammal faunal assemblages on the south coast suggest that people in the MSA exploited ungulates and fur seals less effectively (Klein & Cruz-Uribe 1996), but the YFT1 faunal sample is too small for meaningful comparison to local LSA assemblages. In addition, the west and south coasts have long differed in their ungulate communities, and any MSA/LSA ungulate contrast would have to take this into account. The YFT1 bird fauna is also small, but it tentatively suggests the dominance of penguins over cormorants that also characterizes south coast MSA sites. Cormorants tend to dominate penguins in LSA faunas on both coasts, and the MSA/LSA difference may reflect a difference in technology. A difference in technology also probably explains why fish are much more common in LSA sites. Only LSA assemblages contain artefacts that resemble ethnohistoric projectile armatures (Deacon 1984a; Deacon 1995) and projectile weapons could have allowed people in the LSA to prey more effectively on airborne birds.

TORTOISE SIZE

The MSA tortoise humeri from Die Kelders 1 and Blombos Cave on the southwest coast tend to be significantly larger than local LSA specimens (Klein & Cruz-Uribe 2000; Henshilwood *et al.*

TABLE 3. *The Number of Identified Specimens (NISP) and the Minimum Number of Individuals (MNI) they represent for each mammal species in the Upper, Middle, and Lower subdivisions of YFT1. The NISPs and MNIs for the bovid species were estimated from only dentitions and horncores. The NISPs and MNIs for the bovid size classes were estimated from all skeletal elements. The small bovids identified to species are steenbok and steenbok/grysbok, the large–medium bovids are blue antelope, southern reedbuck, black wildebeest, and kudu, and the large bovids are eland and long-horned buffalo. So far, there are no small–medium bovid dentitions or horncores, but springbok* (Antidorcas australis) *is a likely species for the postcranial bones.*

| Vernacular names | Linnaean names Mammalia | Upper | | Middle | | Lower | |
|-------------------------|-----------------------------------|-------------|------------|-------------|------------|----------------|------------|
| Mammals | | NISP | MNI | NISP | MNI | NISP | MNI |
| Hare | Lepus sp. | 11 | 4 | 10 | 2 | $\mathbf{1}$ | |
| Cape dune molerat | Bathyergus suillus | 1518 | 44 | 38 | 3 | 958 | 32 |
| Porcupine | Hystrix africaeaustralis | 3 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 1 | |
| Black-backed jackal | Canis mesomelas | | | 1 | | | |
| Honey badger | Mellivora capensis | 2 | 1 | | 1 | $\mathbf{1}$ | 1 |
| Hyaena | Hyaenidae gen. et sp. indet. | 2 | 2 | 3 | | | |
| Wildcat | Felis libyca | 5 | 2 | 2 | | | |
| Caracal or serval | Felis caracal aut F. serval | 8 | 2 | 3 | 1 | 2 | |
| Cape fur seal | Arctocephalus pusillus | 93 | 6 | 84 | 4 | 28 | 5 |
| Rock hyrax | Procavia capensis | 1 | | | | | |
| Indeterminate equid | Equus sp. | 1 | 1 | | | | |
| Black rhinoceros | Diceros bicornis | | | | | 2 | |
| Rhinoceros | Rhinocerotidae gen. et sp. indet. | | | 4 | 2 | 3 | |
| Steenbok | Raphicerus campestris | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | | |
| Grysbok/steenbok | Raphicerus sp./spp. | 10 | 2 | 6 | 3 | 5 | 3 |
| Blue antelope | Hippotragus leucophaeus | 14 | 5 | 2 | 2 | $\overline{4}$ | 4 |
| Southern reedbuck | Redunca arundinum | 8 | 3 | 7 | 3 | 28 | 5 |
| Black wildebeest | Connochaetes gnou | | | 2 | 1 | $\overline{2}$ | |
| Greater kudu | Tragelaphus strepsiceros | | 3 | 3 | 1 | 2 | |
| Eland | Taurotragus oryx | 4 | 3 | 1 | 1 | 1 | |
| Long-horned buffalo | Pelorovis antiquus | 1 | | | | | |
| Small bovid/s | | 40 | 5 | 40 | 4 | 24 | 5 |
| Small-medium bovid/s | | 12 | 3 | 13 | 2 | 17 | 6 |
| Large-medium bovid/s | | 79 | 7 | 39 | 4 | 135 | 9 |
| Large bovid/s | | 15 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 8 | 2 |

2001b), and Figure 12 shows that west coast MSA and LSA tortoise humeri differ in the same way. The figure employs the same boxplot format as Figure 11, in which the key features are the median, represented by the line near the middle of each boxplot and the 95% confidence limits for the median, represented by the gray bar around each median. Medians whose 95% confidence limits do not overlap differ significantly in the conventional statistical sense.

In Figure 12, the tortoise humeri from adjacent YFT1 strati-

graphic groups are combined to provide numerically meaningful samples, and included in the figure are tortoises from Hoedjiespunt 1 and Diepkloof, the only other west coast MSA sites that have provided adequate numbers for comparison. The specimens from Diepkloof have been divided among six successive culture-stratigraphic units, defined by Rigaud *et al.* (2006) and Cedric Poggenpoel (pers. comm. 2007), but the chronological relationships between the Diepkloof units, Hoedjiespunt 1, and YFT1 are uncertain. The arrangement of

FIG. 9. *The weights of ostrich eggshell and of granite limpets, granular limpets, Argenville's limpets, and black mussels as percentages of the combined eggshell, limpet and mussel weights in each YFT1 stratigraphic group. The numbers in brackets are the combined weights in grams.*

YFT1 and Hoedjiespunt 1 below Diepkloof in the figure is strictly for presentation purposes.

The LSA samples in the figure span the interval between 12.5 and 0.7 ka ago. There are no samples that predate 12.5 ka ago. Other west coast sites have also provided samples that postdate 12.5 ka ago and particularly, 4.5 ka ago. Table 2 lists some of the key sites, and Figure 1 shows their locations. Their inclusion would clutter the figure, and it would not alter the basic pattern: tortoise humerus size varies within both the MSA and the LSA, but on average, the MSA humeri all tend to be significantly larger than their LSA counterparts. Tortoise collection requires no special expertise or technology, and people in both the MSA and the LSA probably undertook it casually while they foraged for other terrestrial animals and plants. While foraging, they took the largest tortoises first, since these were the most conspicuous and meatiest. Any increase in the number of person hours devoted to foraging would thus tend to reduce average tortoise size, and the most likely explanation for an increase in person hours is an increase in the number of foragers. This number in turn would depend on the interaction of environment and culture.

We noted above that the YFT1 mammal fauna suggests the surroundings were at least as rich as the surroundings of any LSA site, and the same case can be made for Hoediiespunt 1 and Diepkloof. If we accept that average tortoise size reflects human population density, the implication is that populations in the MSA were mostly more sparsely distributed for technological, not environmental reasons. However, variation in technology could also explain fluctuating human population density within the MSA and LSA. Technological variability is less obvious within the MSA and within the LSA than it is between them, and environment is thus more likely to explain the fluctuating population density that is internal to each. We show below that limpet size exhibits the same basic pattern as tortoise size, and this enhances the likelihood that culture (as opposed to environment) mostly explains the MSA/LSA contrast, since tortoises and limpets come from completely separate ecosystems.

FIG. 10. *Top: probable stone tool marks on a rib fragment. Bottom: probable stone tool marks on a large medium bovid pelvic fragment from the MSA layers at YFT1 (photographs: G. Avery).*

INVERTEBRATES

Invertebrates, mainly intertidal shellfish, dominate faunal assemblages at most coastal MSA and LSA sites, and YFT1 conforms to this pattern. Diepkloof may appear to be an exception, but it is located 17 km from the coast at the head of the Verlorenvlei and it was probably even further from the sea during most of the MSA occupation. It is thus not strictly a coastal site, and the MSA faunal assemblage includes few shells.

Table 5 lists the YFT1 shellfish species, their shell weights, and the Minimum Number of Individuals (MNI) in the three main stratigraphic subdivisions. The whale barnacles deserve special mention, since they must have been introduced on whale blubber, and they show that beached whales should be added to the YFT1 MSA mammal list. Whale barnacles have also been found at LSA sites (Jerardino & Parkington 1993; Kandel & Conard 2003) and in an MSA occupation at Pinnacle Point (Marean *et al.* 2007), where they likewise imply that people brought home whale tissue, even when whale bones are absent.

With the exception of the brown mussel, the intertidal species listed in Table 5 all occurred on the west coast historically, and they imply fundamental continuity in local intertidal conditions, including cool-to-cold water temperatures. The brown mussel is adapted to much warmer waters on the south and east coasts of South Africa, and it is far less common at YFT1 than its west coast counterpart, the black mussel. However, even its rare occurrence might signal a time, probably during OIS 5, when warm eddies originating from the Agulhas Current allowed viable larvae to establish small, persistent populations in sheltered west coast bays. Similarly, during the Last Glaciation, small numbers of black mussels extended onto the south coast as far east as Klasies River (Thackeray 1988), and black mussels far outnumber brown mussels in the terminal

Pleistocene deposits at Nelson Bay Cave, 12–11 ka ago (Klein 1972a). The implication is that south coast waters were cooler during glacial intervals.

Table 5 shows that granite limpets, granular limpets, Argenville's limpets, black mussels and white mussels dominate the YFT1 sequence. The three limpet species and black mussels attach to rocks within the intertidal zone, and they are the most numerous, most visible and most easily collected intertidal molluscs on the west coast (Branch *et al.* 1981; Branch *et al.* 1994). White mussels inhabit intertidal sands, where their colonies are sub-surface, relatively diffuse and inconspicuous. Their occurrence in an archaeological site implies the proximity of a sandy beach like the extensive one that occurs near YFT1 today. At YFT1 and many other west coast sites, black mussels dominate other species by a factor of 10 or more, probably partly because they were more common nearby and partly because their high flesh-to-shell ratio suggests that people more often carried them from shore to camp. However, there are LSA middens, for example, on the Namaqualand coast, 300–500 km north of Ysterfontein (Halkett 2003; Orton & Halkett 2005; Orton *et al.* 2005; Dewar 2007; Orton 2007a), where limpets dominate black mussels or even occur alone, and the difference may reflect differences in season of occupation or differences in coastal configuration. With regard to season, black mussels accumulate the toxins from massive phytoplankton blooms ('red tides') that occur mostly in summer, and limpets would thus dominate in sites that were occupied mainly in summer. With regard to shoreline configuration, black mussels are filter feeders that benefit when wave action introduces fresh food, and they prefer rocks that are exposed to the open sea. Limpets are grazers whose feeding is disrupted when waves threaten to dislodge them, and they prefer sheltered embayments or gullies. Depending on local circumstances, even small sea-level changes can reshape the coastline to favour black mussels or limpets, and the sea-level changes that occurred from late OIS 2 through to OIS 1 probably account for major shifts in the black mussel to limpet ratio

over the past 11 ka in the LSA deposits of Elands Bay Cave (Parkington 1981; Parkington, in press a).

Figure 13 illustrates the black mussel to limpet ratio at YFT1 and in the LSA middens that accumulated between about 4.5 and perhaps 0.7 ka ago at Bakoond, about 3 km south of YFT1. Compared to Bakoond or Elands Bay Cave, the YFT1 ratio appears to be relatively stable, and this might mean that YFT1 formed during a period of relatively stable sea-level, perhaps during the latter part of OIS 5.

SPECIES DIVERSITY AND RICHNESS

Despite the widely shared MSA and LSA emphasis on black mussels and three limpet species, YFT1 and other west coast MSA sites differ from local LSA sites in four striking respects (Halkett *et al.* 2003; Parkington 2003): 1. The MSA assemblages are even more heavily dominated by black mussels and the three principal limpets and they tend to be significantly poorer in whelks, topshells (winkles), and barnacles. 2. The MSA assemblages lack chelipeds of the crayfish or 'rock lobster' (*Jasus lalandii*) that are a numerically variable but consistent feature of west coast LSA faunal assemblages, including for example, the assemblage from Bakoond. 3. The MSA assemblages are noticeably poorer in granular limpets relative to granite and Argenville's limpets, and 4. On average, individuals of all three limpet species tend to be significantly larger in the MSA samples. Figure 13 uses the Bakoond sample to illustrate the tendency for granular limpets to be more common in LSA assemblages. The following subsection addresses the MSA/LSA contrast in limpet size.

The rarity or absence of fish in coastal MSA sites and the heavy MSA emphasis on just four or five shellfish species suggests that, compared to their successors in the LSA, people in the MSA exploited coastal resources less intensively or more selectively. More selective exploitation could further explain why MSA assemblages tend to contain significantly fewer granular limpets. Adult granular limpets are more accessible than adults of the other two principal limpet species, because

FIG. 11. *The least squares regression of molerat distal humerus breadth on rainfall, the 95% confidence limits for the regression, and boxplots summarizing distal humerus breadth in fossil samples from YFT1, from a calcrete crevice (SHFL) adjacent to the Sea Harvest MSA site (Grine & Klein 1993), and two successive LSA occupation pulses or episodes at Elands Bay and Tortoise Caves (references in Table 2). Modern molerat humeri are indicated by bold slashes (females) and crosses (males). The numbers in brackets following the site abbreviations are the numbers of measured humeri, and the numbers below the abbreviations are their estimated ages. A small carnivore probably accumulated the SHFL sample, and its age is conjectural. The key elements in each boxplot are the median, represented by the line near the center of each plot, the open rectangle which encloses the middle half of the data (between the 25th and 75th percentiles), the shaded rectangle which indicates the 95% confidence limits for the median, and the line bisecting each plot, which signifies the range of more or less continuous data. Starbursts and open circles mark outliers (values that are especially far from the median). Chance is unlikely to explain the difference between two medians whose 95% confidencelimits do not overlap. Samples whose confidence limits lie above the upper confidence limit for the regression line imply higher-than-expected rainfall; samples whose confidence limits lie below the lower limit imply lower-than-expected rainfall.*

they tend to live higher on the shore. However, they are also smaller, and more selective collectors would thus be more likely to ignore them. The smaller populations in the MSA, that we postulate above and again below, probably explain why shellfish were collected less intensively in the MSA.

LIMPET AND MUSSEL SIZE

Figures 14–17 employ the same boxplot format as Figures 11 and 12 to compare limpet and black mussel size between YFT1 and other west coast MSA and LSA sites. Sample size and the availability of appropriate measurements determined which MSA and LSA samples were included in each figure. The caption to Figure 11 explains the boxplot format, and the key elements are the median near the center of each plot and the 95% confidence limits for the median, indicated by a gray bar around the median. Medians whose 95% confidence limits do not overlap are significantly different in the conventional statistical sense.

In Figures 15 and 16, granular and Argenville's limpets from adjacent YFT1 stratigraphic groups are combined to allow for statistically meaningful comparisons. The resultant groupings do not correspond to those for the molerats and tortoises above, because the stratigraphic distributions of molerats, tortoises, granular limpets, and granular limpets do not coincide, due at least in part to small sample sizes. The limpets are common overall and the larger samples that are likely to be available from the 2008 excavations should permit finer stratigraphic subdivision. This is important to determine the range of average size in each species, to investigate whether size shifts in one or more species correlate with shifts in species abundance or other variables, and if such correlations exist, whether they also characterize LSA sites like Bakoond. All the

FIG. 12. *Boxplots describing the mediolateral diameter of angulate tortoise distal humeri in various MSA and LSA samples. The caption to figure 11 explains the boxplot format. Site names are abbreviated thus: BK Bakoond; KBB Kasteelberg B; EBC/TC 1 Elandsbay Cave Layers 1–4 and Tortoise Cave Layers 1–2A; EBC/TC 2 Elands Bay Cave layer 5 and Tortoise Cave Layers 2B–4; EBC/TC 3 Elands Bay Cave Layers 6–9 and Tortoise Cave Layers 5–13A; SBF Steenbokfontein; EBC 4 Elands Bay Cave Layers 10–14; EBC 5 Elands Bay Cave Layers 15–19; DRS Diepkloof; HDP1 Hoedjiespunt 1; YFT1 Ysterfontein 1.*

figures stress Bakoond because it is so near to YFT1, but the limpet and mussel measurements we have from other LSA sites support the same conclusions.

Figures 14 and 15 summarize average size in granite and granular limpets that modern collectors accumulated in 10 minutes from intertidal rocks at localities (BKB Bokbaai, CST Cape St. Martin and NMB Noordwesbaai) near the town of Paternoster (Buchanan *et al.* 1978). No one else had collected from the rocks in recent times, and the collectors harvested the largest specimens first. The average size of the limpets in each sample is thus an estimate of maximum potential size in the absence of human exploitation. Figures 14 and 15 include limpet samples that Yates (unpublished) systematically extracted from a fossil ('Eemian') beach at Steenbokfontein (SBFEB) and that provide an estimate of average (as opposed to maximum) limpet size long prior to the LSA. Figure 17 includes black mussels from the same fossil beach and also from recent beaches at Ysterfontein (YFTB) and Duinefontein (DFTB),

about 35 km to the south. Storm surges produced the recent beach samples, and they probably provide a rough indication of average black mussel size on rocks that are not presently exploited.

Figures 14–16 show that all three limpet species and the black mussels vary in average size within both the MSA and the LSA. However, the figures also show that the limpets from YFT1 and other MSA sites tend to be significantly larger than their LSA counterparts, whereas the mussels may have been smaller. Observations from LSA sites we have not included in the figures confirm the larger size of the MSA limpets, but they suggest that average mussel size within the LSA overlapped or encompassed MSA variation (Parkington 2003). Mussels that are as small, or smaller, than the MSA specimens in Figure 17 are especially common in LSA deposits predating 8 ka ago, and we conclude that only limpet size consistently differentiates the MSA from the LSA.

In average size, only the MSA limpets equal or exceed the

FIG. 13*. Percentage representation of Argenville's limpets, granite limpets, granular limpets and black mussels in successive stratigraphic units at Ysterfontein 1 and Bakoond.*

large limpets in the fossil beach. The MSA limpets are also much closer in size to the especially large limpets in the ten-minute samples. Like tortoise collection, limpet collection demands no special tools or risk, and the ten-minute samples provide particularly compelling evidence that collection intensity impacts average limpet size. Collection intensity in turn probably reflects the number of person hours devoted to collecting, and a long-term change in the number of hours is most likely to reflect an increase in the number of collectors. Thus, like the large MSA tortoises, the large MSA limpets also imply that by LSA standards, human populations in the MSA tended to be small. Either culture or environment could be responsible, but the mammalian indications for a favourable MSA environment point primarily to culture. Environmental (as opposed to cultural or technological) variation is more likely to explain why population size fluctuated within the MSA and LSA.

On average, both MSA and LSA black mussels tend to be much larger than those on recent beaches, but this probably shows that in the past people rarely collected beached mussels. Instead, they collected mainly from intertidal rocks, where the typical pattern of black mussel growth ensures that the smallest individuals, represented in the beach samples, occur mainly underneath the largest (Buchanan 1988: 19). The tendency for MSA and LSA mussels to vary within a common range may

appear to contradict the limpet observations, but it need not imply that people in the MSA and the LSA exploited mussels with equal intensity. This is because, unlike the limpets, which are strictly intertidal, black mussels also thrive subtidally, and the ribbed mussel, a species that is plentiful only subtidally, tends to be rare in both MSA and LSA sites. The implication is that neither MSA nor LSA people routinely exploited the subtidal zone, and subtidal black mussels would thus provide a ready source for rapid intertidal colonization. It is further pertinent that black mussels mature much more rapidly than limpets, and they reach adulthood far more quickly. In summary, average mussel size is less likely than average limpet size to reflect variation in stone age collection pressure.

Different shellfish species dominate intertidal waters on the south coast of South Africa (Day 1969; Branch *et al.* 1981; Branch *et al.* 1994;), and in general, south coast MSA and LSA shellfish samples have not been analysed as fully as those on the west coast. However, measurements are available for two common southwest and south coast species, the goat's eye limpet (*Patella (Cymbula) oculus*) and the giant periwinkle (*Turbo sarmaticus*), and in both cases, the pattern is similar to the west coast limpets: MSA specimens tend to be significantly larger than their LSA counterparts (Voigt 1982; Thackeray 1988; Henshilwood *et al.* 2001b; Klein 2001; Steele & Klein 2005/06). This also implies that human populations in the MSA were

63.00 87.00

63.00 89.00

64.00 91.00

37.34 83.63

31.33 66.24

32.20 83.74

39.86 84.19

35.40 82.69

32.30 74.67

31.50 68.38

31.69 73.79

42.80 68.34

37.05 77.73

31.00 72.22

41.41 77.12

32.77 93.60

51.47 83.22

57.18 82.59

57.19 81.63

52.31 84.11

50.43 84.01 47.31 79.13

44.40 88.26

68.77 78.28

53.69 80.08

54.52 85.99

50.61 88.97

54.77 81.34

52.10 82.79

FIG. 14. *Boxplots describing granite limpet lengths in various modern and fossil samples. The caption to Fig. 11 explains the boxplot format. Site names are abbreviated thus: BKB, Bokbaai; CST, Cape St. Martin; NWB Noordwesbaai; SBFEB, Steenbokfontein 'Eemian' Beach; BK, Bakoond; SBF, Steenbokfontein; EBC, D Elands Bay Cave Layers 10–16; BOG2, Boegoeberg 2; HDP3, Hoedjiespunt 3; SH, Sea Harvest; YFT1, Ysterfontein 1.*

relatively small. As at YFT1, the mammals in south coast MSA sites imply relatively favourable environmental conditions, and the implication is that culture is more likely than environment to explain low population density in the MSA. Brown mussels dominate intertidal waters on the south coast and commonly dominate south coast middens to the same extent that black mussels do on the west coast. Brown mussels have extremely fragile shells that fragment readily in archaeological sites and it is difficult to make consistent measurements

on the fragments. Our subjective impression, however, is that the average size of MSA and LSA brown mussels may overlap, and the reasons may be the same as those for black mussels.

So far, only South Africa has provided sites where shifts in shellfish diversity and size coincide with long-term changes in culture, but Oceanic islands provide rough parallels at sites that record first human colonization and its aftermath. A prime example is Matenkupkum Cave, New Ireland, Papua New Guinea (Allen *et al.* 1989: 557–558), where the oldest levels,

FIG. 15. *Boxplots describing granular limpet lengths in various modern and fossil samples. The caption to Figure 11 explains the boxplot format. Site names are abbreviated thus: BKB, Bokbaai; CST, Cape St. Martin; NWB, Noordwesbaai; SBFEB, Steenbokfontein 'Eemian' Beach; BK, Bakoond; SBF, Steenbokfontein; EBC, D Elands Bay Cave Layers 10–16; BOG2, Boegoeberg 2; HDP3, Hoedjiespunt 3; SH, Sea Harvest; YFT1, Ysterfontein 1.*

marking initial colonization about 33 ka ago, contained mostly large individuals of the largest available shellfish species. Younger levels not only provided significantly smaller individuals of the same species, but also a wider range of species overall. The contrasts in species size and diversity between the older and younger layers at Matenkupkum broadly recall the contrasts between YFT1 and local LSA sites, and the driving force in both cases was probably an increase in the number of human collectors.

CONCLUSION

The faunal remains from YFT1 and other west coast sites indicate that, compared to those in the LSA, foragers in the MSA exploited coastal resources less intensively and that they were more sparsely distributed, even when they enjoyed favourable environmental conditions. Faunal remains from south coast sites imply the same MSA/LSA contrast, and the long-standing environmental difference between the coasts strengthens the case that culture, not environment explains MSA/LSA differences. The south coast MSA sites include Blombos Cave, where scored ochre fragments and proposed tick-shell beads are often thought to imply LSA-like culture. The Blombos MSA faunal remains, however, do not imply an LSA-like level of coastal foraging or LSA-like population density, and whatever the cognitive or cultural implications of the artefacts, they do not appear to have conferred a fitness (reproductive and survival) advantage. This may explain why they do not appear to have spread from Blombos Cave and why they did not prompt an Out of Africa expansion.

The expansion occurred only about 50 ka ago, 25 ka after people in the MSA abandoned Blombos, and timing of the expansion suggests that a significant fitness advantage evolved in the transition from the MSA to the LSA. In southern Africa, the main problem with this hypothesis is not the Blombos

FIG. 16. *Boxplots describing Argenville's limpet lengths in various modern and fossil samples. The caption to Figure 11 explains the boxplot format. Site names are abbreviated thus: SBFEB, Steenbokfontein 'Eemian' Beach; BK, Bakoond; SBF, Steenbokfontein; BOG2, Boegoeberg 2; HDP3, Hoedjiespunt 3; SH, Sea Harvest; YFT1, Ysterfontein 1.*

artefacts; it is the gap in the archaeological record between the youngest MSA at 55–50 ka and the oldest unambiguous LSA at 25–20 ka ago. A like-aged hiatus may characterize the archaeological record across most of northern Africa (Camps 1974; Camps 1975; Wendorf *et al.* 1990; Wendorf & Schild 1992; Cremaschi *et al.* 1998; Close 2002) and in both the north and south the cause may have been persistent hyperaridity that reduced human populations in the middle of the Last Glaciation (Deacon & Thackeray 1984; Deacon 1995; Beaumont & Vogel 2006). This stands in contrast to eastern Africa, where a deep drill core from Lake Malawi indicates near-historic moisture between 50 and 35 ka ago (Scholz *et al.* 2007). This area of increased moisture may have extended into eastern South Africa, allowing MSA people to persist here until about 40 ka ago (Wadley 2005b; Jacobs *et al.* 2008).

The rarity or absence of an early LSA makes it impossible to determine whether differences in MSA/LSA foraging developed abruptly about 50 ka ago or more gradually between 50 and 20 ka ago. The Out of Africa expansion implies an abrupt

development, but within Africa, only eastern Africa may have been continuously occupied between 50 and 30–20 ka ago (Ambrose 1998). This corresponds with indications for more favorable climatic conditions there, and it implies that eastern Africa is where we should look for evidence of the MSA/LSA transition. Relevant observations may be slow in coming, partly because paleoanthropological research in eastern Africa focuses on much earlier periods and partly because eastern Africa may lack coastal sites like those that illuminate foraging differences in South Africa.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank the National Science Foundation and the L.S.B. Leakey Foundation for financial support, the Iziko South African Museum for analysis and storage facilities, the Swartland Municipality for supplying electricity to YFT1, Royden Yates for insights into YFT1 site formation and stratigraphy, and John Parkington for pioneer analyses of South African coastal middens. Alex Mackay, Peter Mitchell, and an anonymous referee kindly commented on a draft.

maximum prismatic band breadth (mm) (angled for illustrative purposes)

FIG. 17. *Boxplots describing the breadth of the prismatic band in modern and fossil black mussel samples. Archaeological black mussel shells tend to be highly fragmented, and only the prismatic band can be measured routinely. This borders the straighter margin of each valve, and on whole valves, its breadth correlates closely with total length (Buchanan 1985). The caption to Figure 11 explains the boxplot format. Site names are abbreviated thus: YFTB, Ysterfontein Beach; DFTB, Duinefontein Beach; SBFEB, Steenbokfontein 'Eemian' Beach; BK, Bakoond; HDP3, Hoedjiespunt 3; SH, Sea Harvest; YFT1, Ysterfontein 1.*

REFERENCES

- Allen, J. 1994. Radiocarbon determinations, luminescence dating and Australian archaeology. *Antiquity* 68: 339–343.
- Allen, J., Gosden, C., Jones, R. & White, J.P. 1988. Pleistocene dates for the human occupation of New Ireland, northern Melanesia. *Nature* 331: 707–709.
- Allen, J., Gosden, C. & White, J.P. 1989. Human Pleistocene adaptations in the tropical island Pacific: recent evidence from New Ireland, a Greater Australian outlier. *Antiquity* 63: 548–561.
- Ambrose, S.H. 1998. Chronology of the Later Stone Age and food production in East Africa.*Journal of Archaeological Science* 25: 377–392.
- Aouraghe, H. 2004. Les populations de mammifères atériens d'El Har-

houra 1 (Témara, Maroc).*Bulletin d'Archéologie Marocaine* 20: 83–104.

- Avery, G. 1976. A systematic investigation of open station shell middens along the southwestern Cape coast. Unpublished MA thesis. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.
- Avery, G., Cruz-Uribe, K., Goldberg, P., Grine, F.E., Klein, R.G., Lenardi, M.J., Marean, C.W., Rink, W.J., Schwarcz, H.P., Thackeray, A.I. & Wilson, M.L. 1997. The 1992–1993 excavations at the Die Kelders Middle and Later Stone Age Cave Site, South Africa. *Journal of Field Archaeology* 24: 263–291.
- Backwell, L., d'Errico, F. & Wadley, L. 2008. Middle Stone Age bone tools from the Howiesons Poort layers, Sibudu Cave, South Africa. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 35: 1566–1580.
- Barton, R.N.E. 2000. Mousterian hearths and shellfish: Late Neanderthal activities on Gibraltar. In: Stringer, C.B., Barton, R.N.E. & Finlayson, J.C. (eds) *Neanderthals on the Edge*: 211–220. Oxford: Oxbow Books.
- Barton, R.N.E., Currant, A.P., Fernandez-Jalvo, Y., Finlayson, J.C., Goldberg, P., Macphail, R., Pettitt, P.B. & Stringer, C.B. 1999. Gibraltar Neanderthals and results of recent excavations in Gorham's, Vanguard and Ibex Caves. *Antiquity* 73: 13–23.
- Beaumont, P.B. & Vogel, J.C. 2006. On a timescale for the past million years of human history in central South Africa. *South African Journal of Science* 102: 217–228.
- Berger, L.R. & Parkington, J.E. 1995. A new Pleistocene hominidbearing locality at Hoedjiespunt, South Africa. *American Journal of Physical Anthropology* 98: 601–609.
- Bigalke, E.H. 1973. The exploitation of shellfish by coastal tribesmen of the Transkei. *Annals of the Cape Province Museum (Natural History)* 9: 159–175.
- Bouzouggar, A., Kozlowski, J.K. & Otte, M. 2002. Étude des ensembles lithiques atériens de la grotte d'El Aliya à Tanger (Maroc). *L'Anthropologie (Paris)* 106: 207–248.
- Brain, C.K. 1981. *The Hunters or the Hunted? An Introduction to African Cave Taphonomy.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Branch, G.M., Griffiths, C.L., Branch, M.L. & Beckley, L.E. 1994. *Two Oceans*: *a Guide to the Marine Life of Southern Africa.* Claremont: David Philip.
- Branch, M.L., Branch, G.M. & Bannister, A. 1981. *The Living Shores of Southern Africa.* Cape Town: Struik.
- Brink, J.S. & Deacon, H.J. 1982. A study of a last interglacial shell midden and bone accumulation at Herolds Bay, Cape Province, South Africa. *Palaeoecology of Africa and the Surrounding Islands* 15: 31–40.
- Bruggemann, J.H., Buffler, R.T., Guillaume, M.M.M., Walter, R.C., von Cosel, R., Ghebretensae, B.N. & Berhe, S.M. 2003. Stratigraphy, palaeoenvironments and model for the deposition of the Abdur Reef Limestone: context for an important archaeological site from the last interglacial on the Red Sea coast of Eritrea. *Palaeoecology, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 203: 179–206.
- Buchanan, W.F. 1985. Middens and mussels: an archaeological enquiry. *South African Journal of Science* 81: 15–16.
- Buchanan, W.F. 1988. *Shellfish in Prehistoric Diet*: *Elands Bay, S.W. Cape Coast, South Africa.* Oxford: British Archaeological Reports International Series 455.
- Buchanan, W.F., Hall, S.L., Henderson, J., Olivier, A., Pettigrew, J.M., Parkington, J.E. & Robertshaw, P.T. 1978. Coastal shell middens in the Paternoster area, southwestern Cape. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 33: 89–93.
- Butzer, K.W. 2004. Coastal eolian sands, paleosols, and Pleistocene geoarchaeology of the southwestern Cape, South Africa. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 31: 1743–1781.
- Camps, G. 1974. *Les Civilisations Préhistoriques de l'Afrique du Nord et du Sahara.* Paris: Doin.
- Camps, G. 1975. The prehistoric cultures of North Africa: radiocarbon chronology. In: Wendorf, F. & Marks, A.E. (eds) *Problems in Prehistory*: *North Africa and the Levant*: 181–192. Dallas: Southern Methodist University Press.
- Cleyet-Merle, J-J. & Madelaine, S. 1995. Inland evidence of human sea coast exploitation in Palaeolithic France. In: Fisher, A. (ed.) *Man and Sea in the Mesolithic*: *Coastal Settlement above and below Present Sea Level*: 303–308. Oxford: Oxbow Monographs 53.
- Close, A.E. 2002. Backed bladelets are a foreign country. *Archeological Papers of the American Anthropological Association* 12: 31–44.
- Copeland, L. & Moloney, N. (eds) 1998. *The Mousterian site of Ras el-Kelb, Lebanon.* Oxford: British Archaeological Reports International Series 706.
- Cremaschi, M., Di Lernia, S. & Garcea, E.A.A. 1998. Some insights on the Aterian in the Libyan Sahara: chronology, environment, and archaeology. *African Archaeological Review* 15: 261–286.
- Davies, K.C. & Jarvis, J.U.M. 1986. The burrow systems and burrowing dynamics of the mole-rats *Bathyergus suillus* and *Cryptomys hottentotus*in the fynbos of the south-western Cape, South Africa. *Journal of Zoology, London (A)* 209: 125–147.
- Day, J.H. 1969.*A Guide to Marine Life on South African Shores.* Cape Town: Balkema.
- Deacon, H.J. 1979. Excavations at Boomplaas Cave a sequence through the Upper Pleistocene and Holocene in South Africa. *World Archaeology* 10: 241–257.
- Deacon, H.J. 1989. Late Pleistocene paleoecology and archaeology in the southern Cape, South Africa. In: Mellars, P.A. & Stringer, C.B. (eds) *The Human Revolution*: *Behavioural and Biological Perspectives on the Origins of Modern Humans*: 547–564. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Deacon, H.J. 1995. Two late Pleistocene–Holocene archaeological depositories from the southern Cape, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 50: 121–131.
- Deacon, H.J. & Geleijnse, V.B. 1988. The stratigraphy and sedimentology of the main site sequence, Klasies River, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 43: 5–14.
- Deacon, H.J. & Shuurman, R. 1992. The origins of modern people: theevidence from Klasies River. In: Bräuer, G. & Smith, F.H. (eds) *Continuity or Replacement*: *Controversies in* Homo sapiens *Evolution*: 121–129. Rotterdam: Balkema.
- Deacon, H.J. & Thackeray, J.F. 1984. Late Pleistocene environmental changes and implications for the archaeological record in southern Africa. In: Vogel, J.C. (ed.) *Late Cainozoic Palaeoclimates of the Southern Hemisphere*: 375–390. Rotterdam: Balkema.
- Deacon, J. 1984a. Later Stone Age people and their descendants in southern Africa. In: Klein, R.G. (ed.) *Southern African Prehistory and Paleoenvironments*: 221–328. Rotterdam: Balkema.
- Deacon, J. 1984b. *The Later Stone Age of Southernmost Africa.* Oxford: British Archaeological Reports International Series 213.
- Debénath, A. & Sbihi-Alaoui, F. 1979. Découverte de deux nouveaux gisements préhistoriques prés de Rabat (Maroc). *Bulletin de la Société Préhistorique Française* 76: 11–12.
- d'Errico, F. & Henshilwood, C.S. 2007. Additional evidence for bone technology in the southern African Middle Stone Age. *Journal of Human Evolution* 52: 142–163.
- d'Errico, F., Henshilwood, C.S. & Nilssen, P. 2001. An engraved bone fragment from c. 70 000-year-old Middle Stone Age levels at Blombos Cave, South Africa: implications for the origin of symbolism and language. *Antiquity* 75: 309–318.
- d'Errico, F., Henshilwood, C.S., Vanhaeren, M. & van Niekerk, K.L. 2005. *Nassarius kraussianus* shell beads from Blombos Cave: evidence for symbolic behaviour in the Middle Stone Age. *Journal of Human Evolution* 48: 3–24.
- Dewar, G. 2007. The archaeology of the coastal desert of Namaqualand: a regional synthesis. Unpublished PhD thesis. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.
- Eastham, A. 1989. Cova Negra and Gorham's Cave: evidence of the place of birds in Mousterian communities. In: Clutton-Brock, J. (ed.) *The Walking Larder*: *Patterns of Domestication, Pastoralism, and Predation*: 350–357. London: Unwin Hyman.
- Erlandson, J.M. 2001. The archaeology of aquatic adaptations: paradigms for a new millennium. *Journal of Archaeological Research* 9: 287–350.
- Erlandson, J.M. & Moss, M.L. 2001. Shellfish feeders, carrion eaters, and the archaeology of aquatic adaptations. *American Antiquity* 66: 413–432.
- Evans, U. 1994. Hollow Rock Shelter, a Middle Stone Age site in the Cederberg. *Southern African Field Archaeology* 3: 63–73.
- Garrod, D.A.E., Buxton, L.H.D., Smith, G.E. & Bate, D.M.A. 1928. Excavation of a Mousterian rock-shelter at Devil's Tower, Gibraltar. *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute of Great Britain and Ireland* 58: 33–113.
- Gillespie, R. 2002. Dating the first Australians.*Radiocarbon* 44: 455–472.
- Grine, F.E. & Henshilwood, C.S. 2002. Additional human remains from Blombos Cave, South Africa: (1999–2000 excavations). *Journal of Human Evolution* 42: 293–302.
- Grine, F.E., Henshilwood, C.S. & Sealy, J.C. 2000. Human remains from Blombos Cave, South Africa: (1997–1998 excavations). *Journal of Human Evolution* 38: 755–765.
- Grine, F.E. & Klein, R.G. 1993. Late Pleistocene human remains from the Sea Harvest site, Saldanha Bay, South Africa. *South African Journal of Science* 89: 145–152.
- Grine, F.E., Klein, R.G. & Volman, T.P. 1991. Dating, archaeology and human fossils from the Middle Stone Age levels of Die Kelders, South Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 21: 363–395.
- Halkett, D. 2003. A report on the archaeological mitigation program at De Beers Namaqualand Mines, March 2002 to June 2003. Unpublished report prepared for De Beers Consolidated Mines NM. Cape Town: Archaeology Contracts Office, University of Cape Town.
- Halkett, D.J., Hart, T., Yates, R.J., Volman, T.P., Parkington, J.E., Orton, J., Klein, R.G., Cruz-Uribe, K. & Avery, G. 2003. First excavation of intact Middle Stone Age layers at Ysterfontein, Western Cape Province, South Africa: implications for Middle Stone Age ecology. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 30: 955–971.
- Hearty, P.J., Hollin, J.T., Neumann, A.C., O'Leary, M.J. & McCulloch, M.T. 2007. Global sea-level fluctuations during the Last Interglaciation (MIS 5e). *Quaternary Science Reviews* 26: 2090–2112.
- Hendey, Q.B. & Hendey, H. 1968. New Quaternary fossil sites near Swartklip, Cape Province. *Annals of the South African Museum* 52: 43–73.
- Henshilwood, C.S. 1996. A revised chronology for pastoralism in southernmost Africa: new evidence of sheep at c. 2000 b.p. from Blombos Cave, South Africa. *Antiquity* 70: 945–949.
- Henshilwood, C.S. 1997. Identifying the collector: evidence for human processing of the Cape Dune Mole-Rat, *Bathyergus suillus,* from Blombos Cave, southern Cape, South Africa. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 24: 659–662.
- Henshilwood, C.S. 1998. Blombos Cave. In: Deacon, H.J. (ed.) *Excursion Guide to Sites North and East of Cape Town*: 42–46. Stellenbosch: DUAL Congress 1998.
- Henshilwood, C.S. 2004. Marine shell beads from 75 000-year-old levels at Blombos Cave. *The Digging Stick* 21: 1–4.
- Henshilwood, C.S. 2005. Stratigraphic integrity of the Middle Stone Age at Blombos Cave. In: d'Errico, F. & Backwell, L. (eds) *From Tools to Symbols*: *from Early Hominids to Modern Humans*: 441–458. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.
- Henshilwood, C.S., d'Errico, F., Marean, C.W., Milo, R.G. & Yates, R.J. 2001a. An early bone tool industry from the Middle Stone Age at Blombos Cave, South Africa: implications for the origins of modern human behaviour, symbolism and language. *Journal of Human Evolution* 41: 631–678.
- Henshilwood, C.S. & Sealy, J.C. 1997. Bone artefacts from the Middle Stone Age at Blombos Cave, southern Cape, South Africa. *Current Anthropology* 38: 890–895.
- Henshilwood, C.S. & Sealy, J.C. 1998. Blombos Cave: exciting new finds from the Middle Stone Age. *The Digging Stick* 15: 1–4.
- Henshilwood, C.S., Sealy, J.C., Yates, R.J., Cruz-Uribe, K., Goldberg, P., Grine, F.E., Klein, R.G., Poggenpoel, C.A., van Niekerk, K.L. & Watts, I. 2001b. Blombos Cave, southern Cape, South Africa: preliminary report on the 1992–1999 excavations of the Middle Stone Age levels. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 28: 421–448.
- Herbst, M. & Bennett, N.C. 2006. Burrow architecture and burrowing dynamics of the endangered Namaqua dune mole rat (*Bathyergus janetta*) (Rodentia: Bathyergidae). *Journal of Zoology* 270: 420–428.
- Higgs, E.S. & Vita-Finzi, C. 1972. Prehistoric economies: a territorial approach. In: Higgs, E.S. (ed.) *Papers in Economic Prehistory*: 27–36. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Higgs, E.S., Vita-Finzi, C., Harris, D.R. & Fagg, A.E. 1967. The climate, environment and industries of Stone Age Greece: Part III. *Proceedings of the Prehistoric Society* 33: 1–29.
- Howe, B. 1967. The Palaeolithic of Tangier, Morocco: excavations at Cape Ashakar, 1939–1947. *Bulletin of the American School of Prehistoric Research* 22: 1–200.
- Howe, B. & Movius, H.L. 1947. A stone age cave site in Tangier. *Papers of the Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology, Harvard University* 28: 1–32.
- Inskeep, R.R. 1987. Nelson Bay Cave, Cape Province, South Africa: the Holocene levels.*British Archaeological Reports International Series* 357.
- Jacobs, Z., Duller, G.A.T. & Wintle, A.G. 2003a. Optical dating of dune sand from Blombos Cave, South Africa: II – single grain data. *Journal of Human Evolution* 44: 613–625.
- Jacobs, Z., Duller, G.A.T., Wintle, A.G. & Henshilwood, C.S. 2006. Extending the chronology of deposits at Blombos Cave, South Africa, back to 140 ka using optical dating of single and multiple grains of quartz. *Journal of Human Evolution* 51: 255–273.
- Jacobs, Z., Wintle, A.G. & Duller, G.A.T. 2003b. Optical dating of dune sand from Blombos Cave, South Africa: I – multiple grain data. *Journal of Human Evolution* 44: 599–612.
- Jacobs, Z., Wintle, A.G., Duller, G.A.T., Roberts, R.G. & Wadley, L. 2008. New ages for the post-Howiesons Poort, late and final Middle Stone Age at Sibudu, South Africa. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 35: 1790–1807
- Jerardino, A. 1995. The problem with density values in archaeological analysis: a case study from Tortoise Cave, western Cape, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 50: 21–27.
- Jerardino, A. 1997. Changes in shellfish species composition and mean shell size from a late-Holocene record of the west coast of southern Africa. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 24: 1031–1044.
- Jerardino, A. 1998. Excavations at Pancho's Kitchen Midden, Western Cape coast, South Africa: further observations into the megamidden period. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 53: 16–25.
- Jerardino, A. & Parkington, J.E. 1993. New evidence for whales on archaeological sites in the south-western Cape. *South African Journal of Science* 89: 6–7.
- Jerardino, A. & Swanepoel, N. 1999. Painted slabs from Steenbokfontein Cave: the oldest known parietal art in southern Africa. *Current Anthropology* 40: 542–548.
- Jerardino, A. & Yates, R. 1996. Preliminary results from excavations at Steenbokfontein Cave: implications for past and future research. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 51: 7–16.
- Kandel, A.W. 2004. Modification of ostrich eggs by carnivores and its bearing on the interpretation of archaeological and paleontological finds. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 31: 377–391.
- Kandel, A.W. & Conard, N.J. 2003. Scavenging and processing of whale meat and blubber by Later Stone Age people of the Geelbek Dunes, Western Cape Province, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 58: 91–93.
- Keffen, R.H. & Jarvis, M.J.F. 1984. Some measurements relating to ostrich eggs. *Ostrich* 55: 182–187.
- Kerbis Peterhans, J.C. & Singer, R. 2006. Taphonomy of a lair near the Peers (or Skildegat) Cave in Fish Hoek, Western Cape Province, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 61: 2–18.
- Klein, R.G. 1972a. A preliminary report on the June through September 1970 excavations at Nelson Bay Cave (Cape Province, South Africa). *Palaeoecology of Africa* 6: 177–208.
- Klein, R.G. 1972b. The late Quaternary mammalian fauna of Nelson Bay Cave (Cape Province, South Africa): its implications for megafaunal extinctions and environmental and cultural change. *Quaternary Research* 2: 135–142.
- Klein, R.G. 1975. Paleoanthropological implications of the non-archeological bone assemblage from Swartklip 1, south-western Cape Province, South Africa. *Quaternary Research* 5: 275–288.
- Klein, R.G. 1976. The mammalian fauna of the Klasies River Mouth sites, southern Cape Province, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 31: 75–98.
- Klein, R.G. 1991. Size variation in the Cape dune molerat (*Bathyergus suillus*) and Late Quaternary climatic change in the southwestern Cape Province, South Africa. *Quaternary Research* 36: 243–256.
- Klein, R.G. 2001. Fully modern humans. In: Feinman, G.M. & Price, T.D. (eds) *Archaeology at the Millennium*: 109–135. New York: Plenum Press.
- Klein, R.G., Avery, G., Cruz-Uribe, K., Halkett, D.J., Parkington, J.E., Steele, T., Volman, T.P. & Yates, R.J. 2004. The Ysterfontein 1 Middle Stone Age site, South Africa, and early human exploitation of coastal resources. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 101: 5708–5715.
- Klein, R.G. & Cruz-Uribe, K. 1989. Faunal evidence for prehistoric herder-forager activities at Kasteelberg, Vredenburg Peninsula, western Cape Province, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 44: 82–97.
- Klein, R.G. & Cruz-Uribe, K. 1996. Exploitation of large bovids and seals at Middle and Later Stone Age sites in South Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 31: 315–334.
- Klein, R.G. & Cruz-Uribe, K. 2000. Middle and Later Stone Age large mammal and tortoise remains from Die Kelders Cave 1, Western Cape Province, South Africa.*Journal of Human Evolution* 38: 169–195.
- Klein, R.G., Cruz-Uribe, K. & Skinner, J.D. 1999. Fur seal bones reveal variability in prehistoric human seasonal movements on the southwest African coast. *ArchaeoZoologia* 10: 181–188.
- Klein, R.G. & Scott, K. 1986. Re-analysis of the faunal assemblages from the Haua Fteah and other Late Quaternary archaeological sites in Cyrenaican Libya. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 13: 515–542.
- Lalueza-Fox, C. & Pérez-Pérez, A. 1993. The diet of the Neanderthal Child Gibraltar 2 (Devil's Tower) through the study of the vestibular striation pattern. *Journal of Human Evolution* 24: 29–41.
- Leavesley, M.G., Bird, M.I., Fifield, L.K., Hausladen, P.A., Santos, G.M. & di Tada, M.L. 2002. Buang Merabak: early evidence for human occupation in the Bismarck Archipelago, Papua New Guinea. *Australian Archaeology* 54: 55–56.
- Lombard, M. 2005. Evidence of hunting and hafting during the Middle Stone Age at Sibudu Cave, KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa: a multianalytical approach. *Journal of Human Evolution* 48: 279–300.
- Lombard, M. 2007. The gripping nature of ochre: the association of ochre with Howiesons Poort adhesives and Later Stone Age mastics from South Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 53: 406–419.
- Lombard, M. & Wadley, L. 2007. The morphological identification of micro-residues on stone tools using light microscopy: progress and difficulties based on blind tests. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 34: 155–165.
- Mackay, A. 2006. A characterization of the MSA stone artefact assemblage from the 1984 excavations at Klein Kliphuis, Western Cape. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 61: 181–188.
- Marean, C.W., Bar-Matthews, M., Bernatchez, J., Fisher, E., Goldberg, P., Herries, A.I.R., Jacobs, Z., Jerardino, A., Karkanas, P., Minichillo, T., Nilssen, P.J., Thompson, E., Watts, I. & Williams, H.M. 2007. Early human use of marine resources and pigment in South Africa during the Middle Pleistocene. *Nature* 449: 905–908.
- Marean, C.W., Goldberg, P., Avery, G., Grine, F.E. & Klein, R.G. 2000. Middle Stone Age stratigraphy and excavations at Die Kelders Cave 1 (Western Cape Province, South Africa): the 1992, 1993, and 1995 field seasons. *Journal of Human Evolution* 38: 7–42.
- Marean, C.W., Nilssen, P.J., Brown, K.S., Jerardino, A. & Stynder, D.D. 2004. Paleoanthropological investigations of Middle Stone Age sites at Pinnacle Point, Mossel Bay (South Africa): archaeology and hominid remains from the 2000 field season. *Paleoanthropology* 1: 14–83.
- McBurney, C.B.M. 1967. *The Haua Fteah (Cyrenaica) and the Stone Age of the South-East Mediterranean.*Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Miller, K.G., Kominz, M.A., Browning, J.V., Wright, J.D., Mountain, G.S., Katz, M.E., Sugarman, P.J., Cramer, B.S., Christie-Blick, N. & Pekar, S.F. 2005. The Phanerozoic record of global sea-level change. *Science* 310: 1293–1298.
- Mills, M.G.L. 1978. Foraging behaviour of the brown hyaena (*Hyaena brunnea* Thunberg, 1820) in the southern Kalahari. *Zeitschrift für Tierpsychologie* 48: 113–141.
- Orton, J. 2002. Patterns in stone: the lithic assemblage from Dunefield Midden, Western Cape, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 57: 31–37.
- Orton, J. 2002/2003. Superficial comparisons and reality: a reasssment of the Dunefield Midden and the Swartkop Industry. *Southern African Field Archaeology* 11 & 12: 64–67.
- Orton, J. 2006. The Later Stone Age lithic sequence at Elands Bay, Western Cape, South Africa: raw materials, artefacts and sporadic change. *Southern African Humanities* 18: 1–28.
- Orton, J. 2007a. The sampling of ephemeral shell scatters in Namaqualand, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 62: 74–78.
- Orton, J. 2007b. Final report on excavations at Erven 2149, 2157 and 2158 (Bakoond), Yzerfontein, Malmesbury Magisterial District, Western Cape Province. Unpublished Report. Cape Town: Archaeology Contracts Office, University of Cape Town.
- Orton, J. & Halkett, D. 2005. A report on the archaeological mitigation program at De Beers Namaqualand Mines, August to September 2004. Unpublished report prepared for De Beers Consolidated Mines NM. Cape Town: Archaeology Contracts Office, University of Cape Town.
- Orton, J. & Halkett, D.J. 2007. Excavations at Noetzie Midden, an open site on the Cape south coast. *The Digging Stick* 24: 5–7.
- Orton, J., Hart, T. & Halkett, D.J. 2005. Shell middens in Namaqualand: two Later Stone Age sites at Roowwalbaai, Northern Cape Province, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 60: 24–32.
- Parkington, J.E. 1979. Report on research in the Verloren Vlei 1976–9. In: Parkington, J.E. (ed.) *Reports on Research into the Late Stone Age of the Western Cape*: 1–31. Cape Town: Department of Archaeology, University of Cape Town.
- Parkington, J.E. 1981. The effects of environmental change on the scheduling of visits to the Elands Bay Cave, Cape Province, S.A. In: Hodder, I., Isaac, G.L. & Hammond, N. (eds) *Patterns of the Past*: *Studies in Honour of David Clarke*: 341–359. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Parkington, J.E. 1987. Changing views of prehistoric settlement in the western Cape. In: Parkington, J.E. & Hall, M. (eds) *Papers in the Prehistory of the Western Cape, South Africa*: 4–23. Oxford: British Archaeological Reports.
- Parkington, J.E. 1990. A view from the south: southern Africa before, during, and after the Last Glacial Maximum. In: Gamble, C. & Soffer, O. (eds) *The World at 18 000 BP. Volume 2. Low Latitudes*: 214–228. London: Unwin Hyman.
- Parkington, J.E. 2003. Middens and moderns: shellfishing and the Middle Stone Age of the Western Cape, South Africa. *South African Journal of Science* 99: 243–247.
- Parkington, J.E. 2006. *Shorelines, Strandlopers and Shell Middens.* Cape Town: Creda Communications.
- Parkington, J.E. In press a. From sequence to history: excavations at Elands Bay Cave in context. In: Parkington, J.E. (ed.) *Elands Bay Cave*: *a View of the Past.* Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.
- Parkington, J.E. In press b. Shellfish gathering. In: Parkington, J.E. (ed.) *Elands Bay Cave*: *a View of the Past.* Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.
- Parkington, J.E., Nilssen, P., Vermuelen, C. & Henshilwood, C. 1992. Making sense of space at Dunefield Midden campsite, western Cape, South Africa. *Southern African Journal of Field Archaeology* 1: 63–70.
- Parkington, J.E., Poggenpoel, C., Buchanan, B., Robey, T., Manhire, T. & Sealy, J. 1988. Holocene coastal settlement patterns in the western Cape. In: Bailey, G. & Parkington, J.E. (eds) *The Archaeology of Prehistoric Coastlines*: 22–41. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Parkington, J.E., Poggenpoel, C., Rigaud, J-P. & Texier, P-J. 2005. From tool to symbol: the behavioural context of intentionally marked ostrich eggshell from Diepkloof, Western Cape. In: d'Errico, F. & Backwell, L. (eds) *From Tools to Symbols*: *from Early Hominids to Modern Humans*: 475–492. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.
- Pettitt, P.B. & Bailey, R.M. 2000. AMS radiocarbon and luminescence dating of Gorham's and Vanguard Caves, Gibraltar. In: Stringer, C.B., Barton, R.N.E. & Finlayson, J.C. (eds) *Neanderthals on the Edge*: 155–162. Oxford: Oxbow Books.
- Reece, D. 1998. Middle Palaeolithic shells from Ras el-Kelb. In: Copeland, L. & Moloney, N. (eds) *The Mousterian Site of Ras el-Kelb, Lebanon*: 67. Oxford: British Archaeological Reports.
- Rigaud, J-P., Texier, P-J., Parkington, J.E. & Poggenpoel, C. 2006. Le mobilier Stillbay et Howiesons Poort de l'abri Diepkloof: La chronologie du Middle Stone Age sud-africain et ses implications. *C R Palevol* 5: 839–849.
- Rink, W.J., Rees-Jones, J., Volterra, V. & Schwarcz, H.P. 2000. ESR, OSL, and U-Series chronology of Gorham's Cave, Gibraltar. In: Stringer, C.B., Barton, R.N.E. & Finlayson, J.C. (eds) *Neanderthals on the Edge*: 165–170. Oxford: Oxbow Books.
- Robertshaw, P.T. 1979. Excavations at Duiker Eiland, Vredenburg District, Cape Province. *Annals of the Cape Provincial Museums*(*Human Sciences*) 1: 1–26.
- Robey, T.S. 1987. The stratigraphic and cultural sequence at Tortoise Cave, Verlorenvlei. In: Parkington, J.E. & Hall, M. (eds) *Papers in the Prehistory of the Western Cape, South Africa*: 294–325. Oxford: British Archaeological Reports.
- Roche, J. & Texier, J-P. 1976. Découverte des restes humains dans un niveau atérien supérieur de la grotte des Contrebandiers, à Témara (Maroc). *Comptes Rendus des Séances de l'Académie des Science, Paris* Série D, 282: 45–47.
- Roubet, F-E. 1969. Le niveau atérien dans le stratigraphie côtière à l'Ouest d'Alger. *Palaeoecology of Africa* 4: 124–129.
- Scholz, C.A., Johnson, T.C., Cohen, A.S., King, J.W., Peck, J.A., Overpeck, J.T., Talbot, M.R., Brown, E.T., Kalindekafe, L., Amoako, P.Y.O., Lyons, R.P., Shanahan, T.M., Castañeda, I.S., Heil, C.W., Forman, S.L., McHargue, L.R., Beuning, K.R., Gomez, J. & Pierson, J. 2007. East African megadroughts between 135 and 75 thousand years ago and bearing on early modern human origins. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 104: 16416–16421.
- Schweitzer, F.R. 1974. Archaeological evidence for sheep at the Cape. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 29: 75–82.
- Schweitzer, F.R. 1979. Excavations at Die Kelders, Cape Province, South Africa: the Holocene deposits. *Annals of the South African Museum* 78: 101–233.
- Schweitzer, F.R. & Scott, K.J. 1973. Early occurrence of domestic sheep in sub-Saharan Africa. *Nature* 241: 547.
- Schweitzer, F.R. & Wilson, M.L. 1982. Byneskranskop 1, a late Quaternary living site in the southern Cape Province, South Africa.*Annals of the South African Museum* 88: 1–203.
- Singer, R. & Wymer, J.J. 1982. *The Middle Stone Age at Klasies River Mouth in South Africa.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Skinner, J.D. & Chimimba, C.T. 2005. *The Mammals of the Southern African Subregion.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Skinner, J.D. & van Aarde, R.J. 1991. Bone collecting by brown hyenas *Hyaena brunnea* in the Central Namib Desert, Namibia. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 18: 513–523.
- Smith, A.B. 1987. Seasonal exploitation of resources on the Vredenburg Peninsula after 2000 B. P. In: Parkington, J.E. & Hall, M. (eds) *Papers in the Prehistory of the Western Cape, South Africa*: 393–402. Oxford: British Archaeological Reports International Series 332.
- Smith, A.B. 1992. Origins and spread of pastoralism in Africa. *Annual Review of Anthropology* 21: 125–141.
- Smith, A.B. 2006a. Excavations at Kasteelberg and the origins of the Khoehoen in the Western Cape, South Africa. *British Archaeological Reports International Series* 1537.
- Smith, A.B. 2006b. Kasteelberg: a pastoralist sealing camp in Western Cape Province, South Africa.*Journal of Island and Coastal Archaeology* 1: 109–122.
- South African Navy. 1981. Hydrological Map 'Cape Columbine to Cape Infanta' L(D6)SAN 5. Cape Town: South African Navy.
- Steele, T.E. & Klein, R.G. 2005/06. Mollusc and tortoise size as proxies for Stone Age population density in South Africa: implications for the evolution of human cultural capacity. *Munibe* 57: 221–237.
- Stiner, M.C. 1994. *Honor Among Thieves*: *a Zooarchaeological Study of Neandertal Ecology.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Stiner, M.C. 1999. Palaeolithic mollusc exploitation at Riparo Mochi (Balzi Rossi, Italy): food and ornaments from the Aurignacian through Epigravettian. *Antiquity* 73: 735–754.
- Stiner, M.C. 2001. Thirty years on the 'Broad Spectrum Revolution' and paleolithic demography. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 98: 6993–6996.
- Stynder, D.D., Moggi-Cecchi, J., Berger, L.R. & Parkington, J.E. 2001. Human mandibular incisors from the late Middle Pleistocene locality of Hoedjiespunt 1, South Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 41: 369–383.
- Tankard, A.J. & Schweitzer, F.R. 1976. Textural analysis of cave sediments: Die Kelders, Cape Province, South Africa. In: Davidson, D.A. & Shackley, M.L. (eds) *Geoarchaeology*: 289–316. London: Duckworth.
- Thackeray, J.F. 1988. Molluscan fauna from Klasies River, South Africa. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 43: 27–32.
- Tonner, T.W.W. 2005. Later Stone Age shellfishing behaviour at Dunefield Midden (Western Cape, South Africa). *Journal of Archaeological Science* 32: 1390–1407.
- Tribolo, C., Mercier, N., Selo, M., Valladas, H., Joron, J-L., Reyss, J.L., Henshilwood, C.S., Sealy, J. & Yates, R. 2006. TL dating of burnt lithics from Blombos Cave (South Africa): further evidence for the antiquity of modern human behaviour. *Archaeometry* 48: 341–357.
- Tribolo, C., Mercier, N. & Valladas, H. 2005a. Chronologie des technofaciès Howieson's Poort et Still Bay (Middle Stone Age, Afrique du Sud): bilan et nouvelles données de la luminescence. *Bulletin de la Société Préhistorique Française* 102: 855–866.
- Tribolo, C., Mercier, N. & Valladas, H. 2005b. Chronology of the Howieson's Poort and Still Bay techno-complexes: assessment and

new data from luminescence. In: d'Errico, F. & Backwell, L. (eds) *From Tools to Symbols*: *from Early Hominids to Modern Humans*: 493–511. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.

- Valladas, H., Wadley, L., Mercier, N., Froget, L., Tribolo, C., Reyss, J.L. & Joron, J.L. 2005. Thermoluminescence dating on burnt lithics from Middle Stone Age layers at Rose Cottage Cave. *South African Journal of Science* 101: 169–174.
- Vogel, J.C. 2001. Radiometric dates for the Middle Stone Age in South Africa. In: Tobias, P.V., Raath, M.A., Moggi-Cecchi, J. & Doyle, G.A. (eds) *Humanity from African Naissance to Coming Millennia*: 261–268. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.
- Voigt, E.A. 1982. The molluscan fauna. In: Singer, R. & Wymer, J.J. (eds) *The Middle Stone Age at Klasies River Mouth in South Africa*: 155–186. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Volman, T.P. 1978. Early archaeological evidence for shellfish collecting. *Science* 201: 911–913.
- Volman, T.P. 1981. The Middle Stone Age in the southern Cape. Unpublished PhD dissertation. Chicago: University of Chicago.
- Wadley, L. 2005a. Putting ochre to the test: replication studies of adhesives that may have been used for hafting tools in the Middle Stone Age. *Journal of Human Evolution* 49: 587–601.
- Wadley, L. 2005b. A typological study of the final Middle Stone Age stone tools from Sibudu Cave, Kwazulu-Natal. *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 60: 51–63.
- Wadley, L. 2007. Announcing a Still Bay industry at Sibudu Cave, South Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 52: 681–689.
- Wadley, L., Williamson, B.S. & Lombard, M. 2004. Ochre in hafting in Middle Stone Age southern Africa: a practical role. *Antiquity* 78: 661–675.
- Waechter, J.D.A. 1964. The excavation of Gorham's Cave, Gibraltar, 1951–54. *Bulletin of the Institute of Archaeology* 4: 189–213.
- Walter, R.C., Buffler, R.T., Bruggemann, J.H., Guillaume, M.M.M., Berhe, S.M., Negassi, B., Libsekal, Y., Cheng, H., Edwards, R.L., von Cosel, R., Néraudeau, D. & Gagnon, M. 2000. Early human occupation of the Red Sea coast of Eritrea during the Last Interglacial. *Nature* 405: 65–69.
- Watts, I. 2002. Ochre in the Middle Stone Age of southern Africa: ritualised display or hide preservative? *South African Archaeological Bulletin* 57: 1–14.
- Wendorf, F., Close, A.E., Schild, R., Gautier, A., Schwarcz, H.P., Miller, G., Kowalski, K., Królik, H., Bluszcz, A., Robins, D. & Grün, R. 1990. Le dernier interglaciaire dans le Sahara oriental. *L'Anthropologie* 94: 361–391.
- Wendorf, F. & Schild, R. 1992. The Middle Paleolithic of North Africa: a status report. In: Klees, F. & Kuper, R. (eds) *New Light on the Northeast African Past*: 41–78. Köln: Heinrich-Barth Institut.
- Wickler, S. & Spriggs, M. 1988. Pleistocene human occupation of the Solomon Islands, Melanesia. *Antiquity* 62: 703–706.
- Yates, R.J. 1998. A Phase 2 archaeological investigation of site 1 on Farm 1062 (previously 967), Paternoster, Western Cape. Unpublished Report. Cape Town: Iziko South African Museum.